

Libraries Transformation Project

Additional information, January 2011

In response to requests at the consultation meetings in December, further information is provided below on the following:

1. Options Appraisal
2. Opening Hours Option
3. Costs
4. Performance

1.Options Appraisal

The options for which financial calculations have been carried out are as follows:

Option 1: Retain 7 libraries as follows: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall, Kilburn, Neasden. Maintain current overall book fund and improve outreach and web services but with no addition to resources.

Option 2: Retain 7 libraries as follows: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall, Kilburn, Neasden. Maintain current overall book fund and improve outreach with no addition to resources. Spend an additional £50k per annum on improving web services and introduce Sunday opening at remaining libraries that have not got it at present (Harlesden, Town Hall, Kilburn and Neasden) at an estimated costs of £87k per annum.

Option 3: Retain 6 libraries as follows: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall, Kilburn. Maintain current overall book fund and improve outreach and web services but with no addition to resources.

Option 4: Retain 6 libraries as follows: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall, Kilburn. Maintain current overall book fund and improve outreach with no addition to resources. Spend an additional £50k per annum on improving web services and introduce Sunday opening at remaining libraries that have not got it at present (Harlesden, Town Hall, and Kilburn) at an estimated costs of £65k per annum.

(Option 4 is the preferred option and the business case is built on this)

Option 5: Retain 5 libraries as follows: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall. Maintain current overall book fund and improve outreach and web services but with no addition to resources.

Option 6: Retain 5 libraries as follows: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall. Maintain current overall book fund and improve outreach with no addition to resources. Spend an additional £50k per annum on improving web services and introduce Sunday opening at remaining libraries that have not got it at present (Harlesden and Town Hall) at an estimated costs of £44k per annum.

Option 7 Do Nothing

The 'do nothing' option is undesirable for five main reasons

- The performance and usage of individual libraries in Brent varies enormously in terms of value for money.
- Some libraries in the borough are located close to each other and accessibility to transport links varies.
- Where shared services in well located buildings have been possible, usage of libraries has risen dramatically.
- A clarity of library service offer is needed so that residents can take full advantage
- The Comprehensive Spending Review means that all public sector services must look for more efficient ways of delivering services.

Financial detail for each option

OPTION 1 (retain 7 libraries)

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	0.0	-113.5	-123.8	-123.8	-123.8	-123.8
Other savings	0.0	-581.4	-634.2	-634.2	-634.2	-634.2
Gross savings	0.0	-694.9	-758.0	-758.0	-758.0	-758.0
Radio Frequency Identification Technology	0.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Sunday opening	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Net savings	0.0	-628.9	-692.0	-692.0	-692.0	-692.0

OPTION 2 (retain 7 libraries with improvements)

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	0.0	-113.5	-123.8	-123.8	-123.8	-123.8
Other savings	0.0	-581.4	-634.2	-634.2	-634.2	-634.2
Gross savings	0.0	-694.9	-758.0	-758.0	-758.0	-758.0
Radio Frequency Identification Technology	0.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	0.0	45.8	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0
Sunday opening	0.0	80.1	87.4	87.4	87.4	87.4
Net savings	0.0	-503.0	-554.7	-554.7	-554.7	-554.7

OPTION 3 (retain 6 libraries)

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	0.0	-162.9	-177.7	-177.7	-177.7	-177.7
Other savings	0.0	-751.4	-819.7	-819.7	-819.7	-819.7
Gross savings	0.0	-914.3	-997.4	-997.4	-997.4	-997.4
Radio Frequency Identification Technology	0.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Sunday opening	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Net savings	0.0	-848.3	-931.4	-931.4	-931.4	-931.4

OPTION 4 (retain 6 libraries with improvements)

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	0.0	-162.9	-177.7	-177.7	-177.7	-177.7
Other savings	0.0	-751.4	-819.7	-819.7	-819.7	-819.7
Gross savings	0.0	-914.3	-997.4	-997.4	-997.4	-997.4
Radio Frequency Identification Technology	0.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	0.0	45.8	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0
Sunday opening	0.0	60.1	65.5	65.5	65.5	65.5
Net savings	0.0	-742.4	-815.9	-815.9	-815.9	-815.9

OPTION 5 (retain 5 libraries)

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	0.0	-195.6	-213.4	-213.4	-213.4	-213.4
Other savings	0.0	-962.6	-1,050.1	1,050.1	1,050.1	-1,050.1
Gross savings	0.0	-1,158.2	-1,263.5	1,263.5	1,263.5	-1,263.5
Radio Frequency Identification Technology	0.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Sunday opening	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Net savings	0.0	-1,092.2	-1,197.5	1,197.5	1,197.5	-1,197.5

OPTION 6 (retain 5 libraries with improvements)

	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	0.0	-195.6	-213.4	-213.4	-213.4	-213.4
Other savings	0.0	-962.6	-1,050.1	1,050.1	1,050.1	-1,050.1
Gross savings	0.0	-1,158.2	-1,263.5	1,263.5	1,263.5	-1,263.5
Radio Frequency Identification Technology	0.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	0.0	45.8	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0
Sunday opening	0.0	40.0	43.7	43.7	43.7	43.7
Net savings	0.0	-1,006.3	-1,103.8	1,103.8	1,103.8	-1,103.8

Financial benefit summary table for preferred option (Option 4)

1. This note sets out the financial implications of the proposals which include:
 - a. Retention of the following 6 libraries: Willesden Green, Ealing Rd, Kingsbury, Harlesden, Town Hall, Kilburn.
 - b. The roll-out of RFID technology to these libraries will continue in order to support self-service in libraries and lead to more efficient use of staffing at an estimated additional cost from 2011/12 of £66k per annum
 - c. The introduction of Sunday opening at Harlesden, Town Hall and Kilburn (the other three already have Sunday opening) at a cost of £65k per annum from 2011/12.
 - d. Up to an additional £50k per annum on IT improvements to improve web access to library services from 2011/12.
 - e. Retention of the Book Fund at its current value of £550k per annum.
 - f. Improvements in the Outreach Service by reconfiguring the arrangements at no additional cost.
2. The following assumptions have been made:

- a. Closure of libraries which are not retained will be with effect from 1st May 2011.
 - b. Library running costs associated with the opening of the library in the Civic Centre will be met from within the existing library budget.
 - c. All capital and move costs associated with the Civic Centre will be provided for within the relevant project and not as part of this Libraries Project.
 - d. Support service viability will not be affected by loss of income from libraries - mainly photocopying and internal phone charges where it is assumed loss of income from libraries will be reflected in reduced costs.
 - e. Non-staffing costs in the remaining libraries will not be affected by the closure of other libraries;
3. The impact of the proposals on on-going revenue spending is set out in Table 1 below. The net savings after taking account of service improvements are estimated at £742k in 2011/12 and £816k from 2012/13 onwards.

	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
Property savings	--162.9	-177.7	-177.7	-177.7	-177.7
Staff savings	-695.2	-758.4	-758.4	-758.4	-758.4
Other savings	-56.2	-61.3	-61.3	-61.3	-61.3
Gross savings	-914.3	-997.4	-997.4	-997.4	-997.4
Additional costs:					
Radio Frequency Identification Technology (RFID)	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0	66.0
Web improvements	45.8	50.0	50.0	50.0	50.0
Sunday opening (mainly staffing)	60.1	65.5	65.5	65.5	65.5
Net savings	-742.4	-815.9	-815.9	815.9	-815.9

2. Opening Hours Option

Estimated savings if library opening hours cut by 40%

Savings on premises costs would not apply to this option, there may be some savings on utilities but nothing substantial. This option is therefore based on savings from staffing costs - 40% cut to opening hours at each individual library

	Staffing budget	hours per year	cost ph (£)_	40% of	saving
Willesden	530,300	3380	157	1352	212,264
Town Hall	256,800	2652	97	1060	102,820
Ealing Road	265,000	2912	91	1164	105,924
Neasden	171,300	2236	76	894	67,716
Preston	162,000	2236	72	894	64,368
Kingsbury	242,900	2912	83	1164	96,612
Kilburn	216,300	2236	96	894	85,824
Kensal	92,800	1716	54	686	37,044
Tokyngham	107,800	1716	62	686	42,532
Harlesden	251,400	3224	77	1289	99,253
Barham	113,600	1716	66	686	45,276
Cricklewood	111,000	1716	64	686	43,904
	2,521,200	28652			1,003,537

Implications

Redundancies More than if closure options chosen (closure option has premises savings)

Substantial reduction in service availability

Customer dissatisfaction and dip in usage

3. Costs 2010/2011

The table below shows the current cost of the library service at the time of writing (January 2011). These figures are subject to change as in-year savings are made. Inevitably, due to some centrally held budgets, Library HQ costs may include a few small allocations for arts and heritage. Stock, ICT and development costs are based on suggested proportional allocations, not on actuals.

LIBRARIES COSTS 2010/11									
	Staffing	Premises	Supplies	Support	Stock	ICT	Dev't	Training	Total
Barham	113,600	25,400	3,400	5,500	19,500	12,371	1,797		181,568
Cricklewood	111,000	24,000	2,700	7,000	19,500	12,371	1,797		178,368
Ealing Road	265,000	47,400	6,400	12,000	65,000	41,237	5,990		443,027
Harlesden	251,400	50,500	7,000	23,600	65,000	41,237	5,990		444,727
Kensal	92,800	25,500	2,400	8,100	19,500	12,371	1,797		162,468
Kilburn	216,300	35,700	3,300	10,700	32,500	20,618	2,995		322,113
Kingsbury	242,900	800	3,600	150,900	65,000	41,237	5,990		510,427
Neasden	171,300	108,900	2,200	12,100	32,500	20,618	2,995		350,613
Preston	162,000	23,500	3,300	5,400	32,500	20,618	2,995		250,313
Tokyington	107,800	25,500	2,100	7,300	19,500	12,371	1,797		176,368
Town Hall	256,800	0	6,700	152,500	65,000	41,237	5,990		528,227
Willesden	530,300	414,400	17,900	10,900	114,500	136,082	3,767		1,227,849
Outreach	100,300	6,200	2,150	7,000					115,650
Stock Support	132,450	6,200		2,940					141,590
HQ	268,045		76,800	116,160				20,100	481,105
									5,514,413

4. Performance 2007-2010

Issues	Barham Park	Cricklewood	Ealing Road	Harlesden	Kensal Rise	Kilburn	Kingsbury	Neasden	Preston	Tokyington	Townhall	Willesden Green	Total
2007/08	63,263	37,769	196,861	68,013	33,497	65,307	114,722	35,718	107,516	38,514	138,884	252,661	1,152,725
2008/09	61,015	30,033	196,823	29,209	31,390	67,234	191,062	24,579	100,713	34,554	123,040	266,471	1,156,123
2009/10	47,551	40,792	190,746	16,028	31,944	67,465	178,295	48,154	89,919	34,091	111,331	250,330	1,106,646

Visits	Barham Park	Cricklewood	Ealing Road	Harlesden	Kensal Rise	Kilburn	Kingsbury	Neasden	Preston	Tokyington	Townhall	Willesden Green	
2007/08	72,208	48,567	211,408	152,589	51,926	100,314	82,888	62,844	112,323	53,283	158,678	497,992	1,605,020
2008/09	73,384	44,992	209,417	62,934	45,956	100,480	161,429	49,562	105,018	46,983	161,579	511,592	1,573,326
2009/10	62,507	48,634	261,479	29,554	45,691	103,027	205,283	117,604	96,921	46,987	166,955	499,070	1,683,712